

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 320 015

CE 055 109

AUTHOR Fulton, Rodney D.
TITLE Critical Thinking in Adulthood.
PUB DATE 89
NOTE 16p.
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Adult Education; Adult Students; *Critical Thinking;
*Definitions; Educational Philosophy; Educational
Research; *Learning Strategies; Measures
(Individuals); Postsecondary Education; *Thinking
Skills
IDENTIFIERS *Ennis Weir Critical Thinking Essay Test; *Watson
Glaser Critical Thinking Appraisal

ABSTRACT

Critical thinking is often defined as that which a particular instrument measures. The most prominent tests are the Watson-Glaser Critical Thinking Appraisal, the Ennis-Weir Critical Thinking Essay Test, and the Cornell Critical Thinking Tests. Watson and Glaser's (1980) view of critical thinking is "a composite of attitudes, knowledge, and skills." Ennis (1984) uses the terms "critical thinking," "informal logic," and "reasoning" roughly interchangeably, defining critical thinking as "reflective and reasonable thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe or do." Based on this definition, Ennis's model posits 13 dispositions and 12 abilities that together make up critical thinking. From the field of adult education, a simplified concept of critical thinking emerges. Brookfield's (1987) definition of critical thinking is a productive and positive emotive and rational process that is triggered by both positive and negative life events. The following definition of critical thinking was used for the learning strategies instrument developed by the Kellogg Center for Adult Learning Research, Montana State University: "a parallel process by which individuals analyze given information in a contextually specific situation and create new ideas, concepts, or constructs based on their analysis." According to this model, there are four general strategies necessary for critical thinking, two of which are analytical (recognizing and testing assumptions, and assessing contextual parameters) and two of which are creative (generating and testing alternatives, and conditional acceptance). (105 references) (KC)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED320015

Critical thinking in Adulthood

a paper submitted
to
The Kellogg Center for Adult Learning Research
Montana State University
by
Rodney D. Fulton

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R D Fulton

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CE 055 109

A concept of critical thinking

Within the past twenty years, critical thinking has become a much discussed concept both in the field of education and the field of psychology. Much of the research, writing, and speculation during these past two decades has centered on three specific areas-- defining critical thinking, measuring critical thinking, and teaching others how to engage in critical thinking. Each of the three areas is ripe with disagreement and controversy, and a detailed analysis is beyond the scope of this paper.

There are many variations on the definition of critical thinking. Some consider the concept as a product, an end result-- critical thought; others champion the process--critical thinking. Often the concept is limited to logic, reasoning skills, and problem solving. Yet others maintain that the essence of critical thinking lies in reflective thought or the creation of new ideas. Recently, this aspect has been labeled creative thinking and conceived as different than critical thinking.

Practically, critical thinking is often defined as that which a particular instrument measures. The most prominent tests are the Watson-Glaser Critical Thinking Appraisal, the Ennis-Weir Critical Thinking Essay Test, and the Cornell Critical Thinking Tests. Watson and Glaser (1980) view critical thinking

as a composite of attitudes, knowledge, and skills. This composite includes: (1) attitudes of inquiry that involve an ability to recognize the existence of problems and an

acceptance of the general need for evidence in support of what is asserted to be true; (2) knowledge of the nature of valid inferences, abstractions, and generalizations in which the weight or accuracy of different kinds of evidence are logically determined; and (3) skills employing and applying the above attitudes and knowledge. (p. 1)

Ennis (1984) uses "the terms "critical thinking" and "informal logic" and "reasoning" roughly interchangeably" (p.3)
In 1985, Ennis offered the following as the definition of critical thinking

Although there are narrower concepts of critical thinking in some people's minds, I think that the one that is most generally employed is expressed in this definition: Critical thinking is reflective and reasonable thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe or do. Note that there are creative activities covered by this definition, including formulating hypotheses, questions, alternatives, and plans for experiments. Note also that, so defined, critical thinking is a practical activity because deciding what to believe or do is a practical activity. (p. 45)

Based on this definition, Ennis developed a model that posited thirteen dispositions and twelve abilities that together make up critical thinking. While Ennis has stated them somewhat differently in different articles and others have reworded them (Sternberg and Baron, 1985, p.42), in 1985 Ennis reported the following dispositions

1. Seek a clear statement of the thesis or question
2. Seek reasons
3. Try to be well-informed
4. Use credible sources and mention them
5. Take into account the whole situation
6. Try to remain relevant to the main point
7. Keep in mind the original and/or basic concern
8. Look for alternatives
9. Be openminded
10. Take a position (and change a position) when the evidence and reasons are sufficient to do so
11. Seek as much precision as the subject permits
12. Deal in an orderly manner with the parts of a complex whole

13. Be sensitive to the feelings, level of knowledge, and degree of sophistication of others (p. 46)

In a lengthy outline, Ennis followed his thirteen dispositions with twelve abilities grouped into five categories--elementary classification, basic support, inference, advanced clarification, and strategies and tactics. Elementary classification consists of focusing on a question, analyzing arguments, and asking and answering questions of clarification and challenge. Judging credibility, and observing and judging observations make up Ennis' basic support ability. Inference is made up of the following abilities: deducing and judging deductions, inducing and judging inductions, and making and judging value judgments. Defining terms and judging those definitions along with identifying assumptions are what Ennis calls advanced clarification. Finally deciding on an action and interacting with others comprise his strategy and tactics ability. The reader is referred to Ennis (1985 p. 46) for a detailed description yet in Ennis words one that is "only an overall content outline."

From our own field of adult education, we can find a simplified concept of what critical thinking is and what skills are required for one to engage in critical thinking. Brookfield (1987) defines critical thinking as a productive and positive emotive and rational process that occurs in contextually specific events triggered by both positive and negative life events. Based on this concept, Brookfield hypothesizes only four components of the process of critical thinking-- identifying and challenging assumptions, challenging the importance of the context, imagining

and exploring alternatives, and reflective skepticism. For Brookfield reflective skepticism means, " we become skeptical of claims to universal truth or to ultimate explanations....People who are reflectively skeptical do not take things as read." (1987, p.9).

While Brookfield's concept of critical thinking might be labeled as simplistic or too general, Ennis' might be tagged as very complex and detailed. The literature on critical thinking seems to support a concept that critical thinking involves two areas--analytic thought or the judging of information and creative thought or the birthing of new ideas based on the combination of previous information. Further, it seems as if the process of critical thinking requires both attitudes or dispositions that allow an individual to engage in such a process as well as strategies or skills that actually engage a person in the process. From a measurement perspective, some questions arise. Can we in an instrument such as we are proposing really deal with such an in depth analysis as Ennis' model proposes? Or in an instrument which views critical thinking as one of many learning strategies, can Brookfield's more general concept provide enough information? Finally, how do we measure both the attitudes and the strategies of critical thinking? Can a paper and pencil, multiple choice test really assess critical thinking? If so, should we accept that others have already developed such instruments and simply seek permission to use/modify their work to fit our goals? Or would it be better to create a new format by

which to assess the process of critical thinking?

Operational definition of critical thinking

For the learning strategies instrument to be developed by the Kellogg Center for Adult Learning Research, Montana State University, critical thinking is defined as:

A parallel process by which individuals analyze given information in a contextually specific situation and create new ideas, concepts, or constructs based on their analysis.

There are four general strategies necessary for critical thinking.

The analytical aspects of creative thinking

1) **Recognizing and testing assumptions** that are either implicit to the situation or explicitly stated. The critical thinker does not impose his/her own assumptions but can identify those assumptions that are organizing the information presented and then can test those assumptions for validity in the specific context of that situation.

2) **Assessing contextual parameters.** The critical thinker can evaluate both the specificity of a situation as well as the universality of the situation. He/she recognizes both the limits of a certain situation as well as any generalizability always cognizant of cultural implications.

The creative aspects of critical thinking

3) **Generating and testing alternatives** allows the critical thinker to hypothesize and dream while at the same time grounding

alternatives in the realities of the given situation--cultural and individual.

4) **Conditional acceptance** or as Brookfield labeled reflective skepticism allows the critical thinker to avoid universal truth and unquestioned answers. Rather than conceptualizing in black and white, the critical thinker sees the shades of grey. The critical thinker reasons in conditionals, if...then...statements rather than thou shalt commandments.

References Cited

- Brookfield, S. (1987). Developing Critical Thinkers. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Ennis, R. (1984). Problems in testing informal logic critical thinking reasoning ability. Informal Logic. 6 (1). pp 3-9.
- Ennis, R. (1985). A logical basis for measuring critical thinking skills. Educational Leadership. 43 (2). pp 44-48.
- Sternberg, R. & Baron, J. (1985). A statewide approach to measuring critical thinking skills. Educational Leadership. 43 (2). pp 40-43.
- Watson, G. & Glaser, E. (1980). Watson-Glaser Critical Thinking Appraisal Manual. San Antonio, TX: The Psychological Corporation.

CRITICAL THINKING BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Arons, D. (1986). Critical thinking as a self-conscious activity. Liberal Education, 72 (3), 251-252.
- Ashby, D. (1984). Suggestions for staff development in teaching critical thinking. Conference on critical thinking across the curriculum (K-12). New York, New York. (Eric Document Reproduction Service ED 251 191).

- Bass, G. & Perkins, H. (1984). Teaching critical thinking skills with CAI. Electronic Learning, 4 (2) 32,34 & 96.
- Becker, J. (1970). Language experience approach in a Job Corps reading lab. Journal of Reading, 13 (4), 281-284 & 319-321.
- Bell, J. (1988). A guide to critical thinking for Maryland social scientists: a summary report of ideas and resources. (Eric Document Reproduction Service ED296 770).
- Beyer, B. (1985). Critical thinking- what is it? Social Education, 49 (4), 270-276.
- Beyer, B. (1985). Teaching critical thinking: a direct approach. Social Education, 49 (4), 297-303.
- Bozik, M. (1987). Critical thinking through creative thinking. 73rd Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association, Boston, Massachusetts. (Eric Document Reproduction Service ED 290 173).
- Brabeck, M. (1983). Critical thinking skills and reflective judgement development: redefining the aims of higher education. Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology, 4 (1), 23-34.
- Brickman, W. (1976). Adult functional competency and educational malfunctioning. Intellect, 104 (2373), 451.
- Brookfield, S. (1987). Developing critical thinkers: challenging adults to explore alternative ways of thinking and acting. San Francisco, CA.: Jossey Bass.
- Brown, L. & Cook, E. (1971). Selected items for the testing of study skills and critical thinking. Washington, D.C., National Council for the Social Studies.
- Browne, M.N. (1987). Preconditions for encouraging critical thinking on the campus. The International Journal of Social Education, 1 (3), 18-27.
- Carroll, R. (1981). An examination of conceptual problems in teaching critical thinking in social studies education. DAI, 42 (6), 2463A. (University Microfilms Order No. 8125562).
- Chain, B. (1974). An examination of three Paulo Freire-inspired programs of literacy education in Latin America. Literacy Discussion, 5 (3), 393-408.
- Cierzniak, S. (1985). The question of critical thinking: an annotated bibliography. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 260 069).

- Cohen-Rosenthal, E. (1979). Enriching workers lives. Change, 11 (5), 64-66.
- Colbert, K. (1987). The effects of CEDA and NDT debate training on critical thinking ability. 73rd Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association, Boston, Massachusetts. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 286 228).
- Common, D. (1982). Small group instruction in social studies classrooms and the corruption of critical thought. Theory and Research in Social Education, 10 (4), 49-67.
- Cortes, C. & Richardson, E. (1983). Why in the world: using television to develop critical thinking skills. Phi Delta Kappan, 64 (10), 715-716.
- Cruce-Mast, A. (1975). The interrelationship of critical thinking, empathy, and social interest with moral judgement. DAI, 36 (12), 7945A. (University Microfilms Order No. 7613229).
- Cruickshank, D. (1986). Critical thinking skills for teachers. Teacher Education Quarterly, 13 (1), 82-89.
- Davis, K. (1986). Teaching critical thinking on the college campus: an across the curriculum approach. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service 270 732).
- DeBons, E. (1984). Critical thinking is not enough. Educational Leadership, 42 (1), 16-17.
- Dhillon, P.K. & Mehra, D. (1987). The influence of social class and sex on primary school children's creative thinking. Asian Journal of Psychology and Education, 18 (2), 1-10.
- Eason, L. (1986). The relationship of critical thinking skills and psychological type in community college students' responses to science instruction. DAI, 47 (11), 3952A. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8704157).
- Ennis, R. (1962). A concept of critical thinking. Harvard Educational Review, 32 (1), 81-111.
- Ennis R. (1963). Needed: research in critical thinking. Educational Leadership, 21 (1), 17-20 & 39.
- Ennis, R. (1984). Problems in testing informal logic, critical thinking reasoning ability. Informal logic, 6 (1), 3-9.
- Ennis, R. (1985). A logical basis for measuring critical thinking skills. Educational Leadership, 43 (2), 44-48.

- Etheridge, R. (1971). Individual value orientations and critical thinking ability of persons enrolled in selected adult and community college education courses. DAI, 36 (4), 1980A. (University Microfilms Order No. 7515902).
- Facione, P. (1986). Testing college level critical thinking. Liberal Education, 72 (3), 221-231.
- Farmer, J. (1974). Strengthening a design for evaluating a broad-aimed functional literacy & family life education program. Literacy Discussion, 5 (3), 421-440.
- Fea, H. (1974). Critical thinking in communication. Conference on Compensatory/Remedial Education, Occasional Paper No.23, Washington University, Seattle, WA. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service 097 050).
- Florian, L. (1984). The relationship between teachers' participation in a critical thinking staff development program and their students' performance in critical thinking. DAI, 45 (12), 353. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8503832)
- Follman, J. (1970). Critical reading- critical thinking & college reading. College Reading Association Conference, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 039 107).
- Forisha-Thiel, A. (1983). The relationship of selected personality and cognitive factors to critical thinking among graduate students in educational psychology. DAI, 44 (11), 3325A. A doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California.
- Fritz, P. (1986). Teaching critical thinking skills in the basic speaking course: a liberal arts perspective. Communication Education, 35 (2), 174-182.
- Gartenhaus, A. (1984). Museums and critical thinking skills for students. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service 249 128).
- Garver, E. (1986). Critical thinking, them, and us: a response to Arnold B. Aron's " 'Critical thinking' and the baccalaureate curriculum". Liberal Education, 72 (3), 245-249.
- Gibson, H. (1985). Critical thinking: a communication model. DAI, 46 (11), 3235A. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8601471).
- Guyton, E. (1988). Critical thinking and political participation: development and assessment of a causal model. Theory and

Research in Social Education, 16 (1), 23-49.

- Hadlock, A. (1958). A study of the development of critical thinking through adult discussion groups. A doctoral dissertation, UCLA.
- Hallock, S. (1986). I never know what I think until I see what I say (honing critical thinking skills through writing). 76th Annual Meeting of the National Council of Teachers of English. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 282 234).
- Heiman, M. (1985). Critical thinking skills: analysis and action series. Washington, D.C., National Education Association. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 265 501).
- Hendrickson, A. (1984). Developing Critical Thinking Skills. Conference on thinking, Cambridge, Massachusetts. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 264 093).
- Hitchcock, D. (1982). Critical Thinking: a guide to evaluating information. Methuen: New York, New York.
- Howell, W. & King, S. (1980). Intersexual communication in American culture. 30th Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, Acapulco, Mexico. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 193 717).
- Karra, R. (1987). Teaching history through critical thinking. Social Science Record, 24 (1), 13-20.
- Keeley, S. & Browne, M. (1986). How college seniors operationalize critical thinking behavior. College Student Journal, 20 (4), 389-395.
- Kurfiss, J. (1988). Critical thinking. Washington, D.C.: ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report 2.
- Litwin, J. & Haas, P. (1983). In the classroom critical thinking: an intensive approach. The Journal of Learning Skills, 2 (3), 43-47.
- Lowell, F. (1969). An analysis of changes in critical thinking ability, open-mindedness, and farm policy opinions of participants in the Kellogg Farmers Study Program. DAI, 30 (6), 2319A. (University Microfilms Order No. 6920923).
- Lucas, G. (1983). Teaching critical thinking skills. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 235 062).
- Markle, A. (1987). Developing critical thinking skills through literature. School Library Media Quarterly, 16 (1), 43-44.

- Martinelli, K. (1987). Thinking straight about thinking. The School Administrator, 44 (1), 21-23.
- Mayes, C. (1986). Critical thinking, dogmatism, and self-concept as predictors of success of adult basic education students. DAI, 47 (6), 1957A. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8617368).
- McCormack, K. (1987). Improving student thinking at the community college. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service 284 608).
- McPeck, J. (1984). Stalking beasts, but swatting flies: the teaching of critical thinking. Canadian Journal of Education, 9, 28-44.
- Modjeski, R. & Michael, W. (1983). An evaluation by a panel of psychologists of the reliability and validity of two tests of critical thinking. Educational & Psychological Measurement, 43 (4), 1187-1197.
- Monroe, B. (1985). An analysis of critical thinking skills of college freshmen from three divergent high school backgrounds. DAI, 46 (10), 2907A. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8526814).
- Morris, B. (1987). From critical listening to critical analysis: a directed listening approach for the basic course. 73rd Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association. Boston, Massachusetts. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 288 231).
- Moss, P. & Petrosky A. (1983). A proposal for measuring critical thinking. Annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Montreal, Canada.
- Meyers, C. (1986). Teaching students to think critically. San Francisco, CA.: Jossey-Bass.
- Nanko, M. (1987). Critical thinking ability, dogmatism, ambiguity tolerance and belief in the paranormal. DAI, 48 (3), 918B. (University Microfilms Order No. DA8711452).
- Norris, S. (1985). Synthesis of research on critical thinking. Educational Leadership, 42 (8), 40-45.
- Norris, S. (1988). Controlling for background beliefs when developing multiple-choice critical thinking tests. Educational Measurement Issues and Practices, 7 (3), 5-11.
- Norris, S. (1988). Research needed on critical thinking. Canadian Journal of Education, 13 (1), 125-137.

- Olson, C. (1984). Fostering critical thinking through writing. Educational Leadership, 42 (3), 28-39.
- Page, H. (1988). Literature across the college curriculum. Journal of Reading, 31 (6), 520-524.
- Parsad, M. & Ojila, S. (1987). Comparative levels of creative thinking in different religio-cultural group of students. Indian Psychological Review, 32 (7), 1-6.
- Paul, R. (1984). Thinking: fundamental to education for a free society. Educational Leadership, 42 (1), 4-14.
- Paul, R. (1984). Critical thinking and educational reform: the emerging revolution. Harvard International Conference on Thinking. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 266 058).
- Paul, R. (1985). Critical thinking research: a response to Stephen Norris. Educational Leadership, 42 (8), 46.
- Paul, R. (1985). Bloom's taxonomy and critical thinking instruction. Educational Leadership, 42 (8), 36-39.
- Phipps, R. (1984). Critical thinking and community college students. 8th Annual Meeting of the National Association for Developmental Education, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 253 264).
- Pierce, W., Lemke, E., & Smith R. (1988). Critical thinking and moral development in secondary students. High School Journal, 71 (3), 120-126.
- Potter, R. (1979). OE Project: critical TV viewing skills. Teacher, 96 (8), 30-32.
- Powell, S. (1987). Improving critical thinking: a review. Educational Psychology, 7 (3), 169-185.
- Quellmalz, E. (1984). Designing an integrated instructional and assessment system for critical thinking skills. Making our schools more effective: proceedings of three state conferences. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 249 589).
- Raymond, J. (1982). Critical thinking abilities in adults. A doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California.
- Reeve, R. & Palinscar, A. (1987). Everyday and academic thinking: implications for learning and problem solving. Journal of Curriculum Studies, 19 (2), 123-133.
- Rossmann, M. (1982). Enhancing learning in the classroom: using

- informal debate. Illinois Teacher of Home Economics, 26 (1), 23-24.
- Rudin, B. (1984). Teaching critical thinking skills. Social Education, 48 (4), 279-281.
- Sardowski, B. (1985). Research notes: critical thinking & CAI. Journal of Computers in Mathematics & Science Teaching, 4 (2), 12-13.
- Schwab, L. & D'Zamko, M. (1988). Group imaging for action: creative thinking & problem solving. The Journal of Creative Behavior, 22 (2), 101-111.
- Shanker, A. (1985). Critical thinking and education reform. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 265 614).
- Shearing, H. (1973). Genius into moron- and back. ETC.- A Review of General Semantics, 30 (4), 381-386.
- Siegel, H. (1980). Critical thinking as an educational ideal. Educational Forum, 45 (1), 7-23.
- Smith, B. (1983). Instruction for critical thinking skills. Social Studies, 74 (5), 210-214.
- Statkiewicz, W. & Allen, R. (1983). Practice exercises to develop critical thinking skills. Journal of College Science Teaching, 12 (4), 262-266.
- Sternberg, R. (1983). Criteria for intellectual skills training. Educational Researcher, 12 (2), 6-12 & 26.
- Sternberg, R. (1986). Critical thinking: its nature, measurement, and improvement. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 272 882).
- Sternberg, R. (1987). Teaching critical thinking: eight easy ways to fail before you begin. Phi Delta Kappan, 68 (6), 456-459.
- Sternberg, R. & Baron, J. (1985). A statewide approach to measuring critical thinking skills. Educational Leadership, 43 (2), 40-43.
- Stovel, J. (1987). Document based questions and testing for critical thinking. Social Science Record, 24 (1), 11-12.
- Suddick, D. (1980). The adult college student: what development educational services do they desire? College Student Journal, 16 (1), 89-91.
- Suttle, B. (1983). Education's failure in critical reflection.

Community College Review, 11 (1), 38-43.

Swartz, R. (1986). Restructuring curriculum for critical thinking. Educational Leadership, 43 (8), 43-44.

Tankard, J. (1987). How to read a newspaper article. Conference on Critical Thinking, Newport News, Virginia. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 281 152).

Taylor, W. (1986). Teaching critical reading as a way of teaching critical thinking. 15th Annual Conference of the International Society for Individualized Instruction, Atlanta, Georgia. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 276 432).

Thompson, B. & Melancon, J. (1987). Validity of a measure of critical thinking skills. Psychological Reports, 60, 1223-1230.

Walters, K. (1986). Critical thinking in liberal education: a case of overkill? Liberal Education, 72 (3), 233-244.

Wells, K. (1983). The development of a critical thinking skills performance assessment: an interdisciplinary approach to validating achievement of school goals. 67th Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Montreal, Quebec. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 229 424).

Wiseman, D., Hunt, G. & Bedwell, L. (1986). Teaching for critical thinking. Annual Meeting of the Association of Teacher Educators, Atlanta, Georgia. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 268 109).